INTERFACE SCIENCE IN THERMAL BARRIER COATINGS

Compositional factors affecting the establishment and maintenance of Al₂O₃ scales on Ni–Al–Pt systems

B. Gleeson · N. Mu · S. Hayashi

Received: 21 October 2008 / Accepted: 6 January 2009 / Published online: 3 February 2009 © Springer Science+Business Media, LLC 2009

Abstract The beneficial role played by platinum addition in promoting the formation of a protective Al₂O₃ scale on representative γ' -Ni₃Al+ γ -Ni coating compositions during high-temperature oxidation is discussed. This beneficial effect can be primarily ascribed to the fact that Pt is nonreactive, and its addition decreases the chemical activity of aluminum in γ' . Related to the latter, Pt partitions almost solely to the Ni sites in the ordered L1₂ crystal structure of γ' , which has the effect of amplifying the increase in the Al: Ni atom fraction on a given crystallographic plane containing both Al and Ni. Such an effective Al enrichment at the γ' surface kinetically favors the formation of Al₂O₃ relative to NiO. A further contributing factor is that the Ptcontaining γ' -based alloys show subsurface Pt enrichment during the very early stages of oxidation. This enrichment reduces Ni availability and can increase the Al supply to the evolving scale, thus kinetically favoring Al₂O₃ formation. This observed benefit of Pt addition promoting exclusive Al₂O₃-scale growth is inferred to be a special form of the third-element effect.

Introduction

The development of heat-treatable nickel-based superalloys has, almost entirely, been motivated by the requirement to

B. Gleeson (🖂) · N. Mu

S. Hayashi Division of Materials Science and Engineering, Hokkaido University, Sapporo 060-8628, Japan improve the efficiency, reliability, and operating life of gas turbines. The most advanced single-crystal superalloy turbine blades are now operating at a temperature greater than 85% of their absolute melting temperature (T_m) [1]. Nibased superalloys achieve high strengths at elevated temperatures through strengthening by a relatively high volume fraction of γ' -Ni₃Al-based precipitates (up to about 70% by volume) in the γ -Ni matrix. These alloys are also strengthened by constituents in solid solution (i.e., W, Ta, Mo, and Re) and perhaps even carbide dispersoids. However, the melting point of nickel (1455 °C) provides a natural ceiling for the temperature capability of nickelbased superalloys [2, 3]. Thus, further increases in the operating temperatures have required advances in external and internal cooling technologies, coupled with the use of thermal barrier coating (TBC) systems [4–6]. Use of a TBC system on an internally cooled component offers the potential to decrease the metallic surface temperature of that component by up to about 150 °C [7].

Commercial advanced TBC systems are typically twolayered, consisting of a ceramic topcoat and an underlying metallic bond coat. The topcoat, which is usually applied either by air plasma spraying (APS) or electron beamphysical vapor deposition (EB-PVD), is most often partially stabilized zirconia (PSZ), with the stabilizing constituent typically being Y₂O₃. The properties of PSZ are such that it has a low thermal conductivity, high oxygen permeability, and a relatively high coefficient of thermal expansion. The PSZ topcoat is also made "strain tolerant" by depositing a structure that contains numerous pores and/ or pathways. The consequently high oxygen permeability of the PSZ topcoat imposes the constraint that the metallic bond coat must be resistant to oxidation attack. Thus, the bond coat is typically rich in aluminum to form a protective, thermally grown oxide (TGO) scale of α -Al₂O₃. In

Department of Mechanical Engineering and Materials Science, The University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, PA 15231, USA e-mail: bgleeson@engr.pitt.edu

addition to imparting oxidation resistance, the TGO serves to bond the ceramic topcoat to the substrate/bond coat system. Even so, it is often found that spallation and/or cracking of the thickening TGO scale is the ultimate failure mechanism of commercial TBCs, particularly EB-PVD TBCs [7–9]. Thus, improving the adhesion and integrity of the interfacial TGO scale is critical to the development of more reliable TBCs.

Given that the potential of a TBC can only be exploited if it remains adhered to the substrate, improving the stability and oxidation behavior of the bond coats continues to be a high-priority for research and development [5]. Strategies to enhancing the bond coat temperature capability have included:

- (1) reducing the TGO growth rate and the concomitant buildup in strain energy [4];
- (2) increasing the yield/creep strength of the bond coat to suppress cyclic plasticity effects, such as surface rumpling during repeated thermal cycles [10]; and
- (3) minimizing interdiffusion with the substrate that leads to Al depletion and migration to the coating surface of elements that are deleterious to oxidation resistance (e.g., Ti, S, Re, etc.) [11].

Considerable past research has focused on understanding and developing metallic bond coats based on the ordered intermetallic compound β -NiAl [12]. In addition to exhibiting a high melting temperature and good thermal conductivity [13, 14], β -NiAl is capable of forming a protective Al₂O₃ scale. Moreover, the adherence of the Al₂O₃ scale can be significantly improved by the addition of platinum to the β coating to produce the so-called Pt-modified aluminide coatings. The addition of Pt to an Al₂O₃-scale forming alloy has been known to improve scale adhesion since the 1970s [15, 16]. However, despite numerous studies of Pt-modified aluminides [17–19], the exact mechanism by which Pt improves the coating performance is still not well understood. It has been proposed that Pt may interact with indigenous sulfur [19, 20], reduce the growth rate of interfacial voids [21, 22], or limit the outward diffusion of minor alloying elements (e.g., Ti, Ta, Re, etc.) from the superalloy substrate [23], all of which would serve to improve scale adhesion.

There are, however, limitations associated with β -NiAlbased coatings owing to surface instabilities (e.g., surface rumpling) and interdiffusion with the Ni-based superalloy substrate. The latter can lead to unwanted topologically close-packed (TCP) phase formation [24, 25]. Indeed, nextgeneration superalloys containing higher levels of refractory metals are even more susceptible to the formation of TCP phases underneath β -NiAl-based coatings [26]. Thus, there is an increasing need for alternative bond coating compositions. Gleeson et al. [27] recently reported that the addition of platinum to γ -Ni+ γ' -Ni₃Al alloys is highly beneficial to promoting exclusive α -Al₂O₃ scale growth. It was shown by Gleeson et al. that the γ + γ' phase constitution could be retained for up to ~35 at.% Pt and an Al range of ~12–22 at.%. Moreover, oxidation resistance could be substantially improved by Hf addition [28].

The purpose of this article is to briefly review the factors affecting Al_2O_3 -scale development followed by a more detailed discussion on the high-temperature oxidation behavior of the Ni–Al system and the influence of platinum in promoting Al_2O_3 -scale formation. It will be shown that platinum provides a beneficial third-element effect that is similar in terms of outcome to the more well-known chromium effect, but mechanistically different.

Al₂O₃-scale formation on Ni–Al-based alloys

There has been much research into the development of protective α -Al₂O₃ scales [29–33] on Al-containing alloys. The systems investigated ranged from simple binary alloys to complex commercial alloys, with or without additions of reactive elements such as Y and Hf. Clearly, a critical factor is the aluminum content in the alloy or coating, which must be sufficiently high to develop and maintain an alumina layer and prevent subsequent breakaway oxidation. A further critical factor in the oxidation of Al₂O₃scale formers is the reaction temperature, which must be high enough to promote the formation of α -Al₂O₃ in preference to the faster growing transition aluminas. Specifically, there are several cubic or transitional Al₂O₃ structures, such as γ , δ and θ that form during a certain transient stage of oxidation at temperatures below about 1100 °C (e.g., during heating). The metastable, transitional Al₂O₃ structures often grow as blades or whiskers [34], and their growth can influence considerably the overall amount of oxidation and the subsequent growth of the stable α -Al₂O₃ phase. For example, eventual transformation from metastable θ -Al₂O₃ to α -Al₂O₃ produces an 8–13% volume reduction, which results in apparent tensile stresses in the scale [35, 36] and scale cracking [37].

Pettit [38] assessed the oxidation behavior of Ni–Al alloys over the temperature range 900–1300 °C and identified three groups of scaling behavior, as shown in Fig. 1. Group I corresponds to internal oxidation of the aluminum, with external formation of NiO doped with aluminum. Group II consists of alloys that contain enough aluminum to form an external α -Al₂O₃ layer, but this depletes the surface to the point at which, if the scale breaks down in some manner, NiO and NiAl₂O₄ may be formed. A protective Al₂O₃ layer may reform in time, but a layered scale develops as these processes repeat. With a higher aluminum content, an exclusive Al₂O₃-scale layer is established



Fig. 1 Dependence of the mechanism of oxidation for Ni–Al alloys on temperature and alloy composition according to Pettit [38]. Oxidation tests were carried out in 0.1 atm pure O_2

and maintained, and corresponds to Group III behavior. Figure 1 shows that an increase in the oxidation temperature helps to promote external Al_2O_3 formation (i.e., Al content for the transition from Group I to Group II decreases with increasing temperature). This is a consequence of the activation energy for (substitutional) aluminum diffusion in the alloy being larger than that for (interstitial) oxygen permeation in the alloy.

The transition from internal to external Al_2O_3 formation requires that a critical concentration of Al in the alloy or coating, N_{Al}^* , be exceeded [1, 39]. As indicated above, the value of N_{Al}^* is dependent on kinetic rather than thermodynamic factors; although, clearly, a sufficient Al concentration must exist at the Al_2O_3 /alloy or coating interface during steady-state growth in order to maintain Al_2O_3 stability. This latter, "thermodynamically required" concentration is usually quite small for a highly stable oxide such as Al_2O_3 [40, 41], and it is significantly below the critical concentration required by kinetics.

In relation to the above discussion regarding Fig. 1, ternary and higher order alloying additions that cause the solubility for oxygen in the alloy to decrease should in turn cause N_{A1}^* to decrease and therefore favor exclusive Al_2O_3 -scale formation (i.e., Group III behavior). This effect is difficult to isolate due to the potential influence of micro-structural and other contributing factors, but it has been invoked as a possible explanation for the beneficial effect of 2% Si (weight percent, wt%) and 1 wt% Ti additions in promoting Al_2O_3 scale formation on NiCrAlY-base alloys [42].

In accordance with the generally so-called third-element effect, the value of N_{Al}^* in Ni–Al-based alloys may also be decreased by additions of elements that form an oxide of intermediate thermodynamic stability to NiO and Al₂O₃. For instance, it is well known that a lower Al content is needed to establish and maintain an Al₂O₃ scale on



Fig. 2 Oxide-scale map for the Ni–Cr–Al system oxidized at1000 °C in air for 20 h and showing the regimes for Al_2O_3 , Cr_2O_3 , $NiAl_2O_4$, $NiCr_2O_4$, and NiO formation (after Wallwork and Hed [44])

M–Cr–Al alloys (where M = Ni, Co, or Fe) than on M–Al alloys [43]. This is shown in the 1000 °C oxide map in Fig. 2 for the Ni–Cr–Al system (based on [44]), where it is seen that exclusive Al₂O₃ scale growth on a Ni–Al alloy requires an Al concentration of at least ~ 34 at.%; whereas, only 10 at.% Al is required if the Ni–Al alloy also contains 6 at.% Cr.

The classical interpretation for the third-element effect is based on "secondary gettering", a phenomenon first proposed by Wagner [45] to explain the promotion of Al₂O₃-scale formation by Zn additions to Cu-Al alloys and Cr additions to Fe-Al alloys. According to the generally purported mechanism for secondary gettering, the oxide of the ternary addition develops extensively in the transient scale and thereby reduces the oxygen potential at the alloy/ scale interface to a value which is significantly lower than if there were no ternary addition. In the case of M-Cr-Al alloys, the lowered oxygen potential reduces the inward flux of oxygen into the alloy and consequently enables Al to diffuse to the surface from the bulk without precipitating as an internal oxide, thus resulting in the development of a continuous Al₂O₃ scale layer at lower Al concentration than in the corresponding binary alloy.

Although secondary gettering is an often-cited mechanism for explaining the third-element effect, not all ternary additions that form oxides of intermediate stability have the desired effect [46]. For instance, the addition of Mn to Fe– Al alloys does not facilitate the establishment of an Al₂O₃ scale when present in high concentrations even though the stability of MnO is intermediate to FeO and Al₂O₃ [46–48]. In this case, the Mn stabilizes the austenite (γ) phase which is hypothesized to sufficiently lower Al diffusivity relative to that in the ferritic α -Fe(Al) phase to the extent that the third-element effect is nullified (work of Jackson and Wallwork reported in Stott et al.'s review article [46]). Alternative mechanisms to explain the third-element effect, based, for example, on modification of subsurface diffusion behavior [49, 50] have also been proposed, reflecting the fact that there is not a complete understanding of how a third element may influence the formation of a protective scale on a single-phase alloy [46].

Pt Effects on Al₂O₃-scale formation

Figure 3 shows plots of the 1150 °C cyclic oxidation kinetics in air of β and $\gamma + \gamma'$ cast alloys with and without Pt addition. The β alloys contain 50 at.% Al, while the $\gamma + \gamma'$ alloys contain 22 at.% Al (i.e., Pt is always added at the expense of Ni). Each thermal cycle consisted of 1 h at 1150 °C followed by 20 min at about 80 °C. Mass change was measured periodically using an analytical balance. Any weight loss in these plots corresponds to scale spallation. Two important inferences can be drawn from the results presented in Fig. 3. First, the addition of Pt to either



Fig. 3 Cyclic oxidation kinetics of β -Ni₅₀Al₅₀, β -Ni₃₅Al₅₀Pt₁₅, γ + γ' -78Ni–22Al, and γ + γ' -58Ni–22Al–20Pt alloys in air. Each thermal cycle consisted of one-hour at 1150 °C followed by 20 min at about 80 °C

the β or the $\gamma + \gamma'$ alloy results in improved scale adhesion, as indicated by the absence of weight loss from the Ptcontaining alloys. Second, Pt addition caused the $\gamma + \gamma'$ alloy to oxidize in a manner similar to that of the Ptmodified β alloy. This is further confirmed in Fig. 4, which shows cross-sectional images of the Pt-modified $\gamma + \gamma'$ and β alloys after 500 cycles of 1-hour duration at 1150 °C. The scale formed on both alloys was α -Al₂O₃ and of similar thickness. Although not shown, the Pt-free $\gamma + \gamma'$ alloy does not form an exclusive scale layer of Al₂O₃ and instead forms a non-protective scale consisting of NiO and NiAl₂O₄ outer layers and a discontinuous inner Al₂O₃ layer. Thus, and as will be discussed in more detail in the following, Pt had the added beneficial effect for the $\gamma + \gamma'$ alloy of promoting exclusive Al₂O₃ formation.

Indeed, earlier reports by Coupland et al. [51, 52] and Tatlock and Hurd [53–55] showed that Pt improves oxidation and hot corrosion resistance of alloys with $\gamma + \gamma'$ compositions. In addition, Felten [56] studied the effect of Pt with Cr addition in low Al (12 at.%) $\gamma + \gamma'$ -based alloys and showed that these alloys were indeed alumina formers. Research efforts prior to 1987 that were concerned with platinum additions to Ni-based alloys for improved oxidation and hot-corrosion resistance were succinctly reviewed by Tatlock et al. [57]. These authors deduced that platinum can play a dual role of promoting Al₂O₃-scale formation and improving scale adhesion; however, the precise mechanisms leading to these roles were not identified.

Figure 5 shows cross-sectional SEM images of a series of Ni–Al and Ni–Al–Pt alloys after oxidation in still air for 100 h at 1150 °C. The images are arranged as a function of Al and Pt contents, which are all in at.%. The benefits of Pt addition in promoting more protective oxidation are clearly seen when comparing the various scale microstructures to that formed on the Pt-free Ni–16Al alloy. As indicated, the scale formed on this Pt-free alloy was multilayered, with a thick outer NiO layer, an intermediate mixed-scale layer of NiO+NiAl₂O₄, and innermost duplex NiAl₂O₄ and discontinuous Al₂O₃ layer. By contrast, an exclusive Al₂O₃ scale developed on the Ni–14Al–10Pt and Ni–12Al–18Pt



Fig. 4 Cross-sectional secondary electron microscope (SEM) images of β -Ni₃₅Al₅₀Pt₁₅ and γ + γ' -58Ni– 22Al–20Pt alloys after 500 onehour thermal cycles to 1150 °C in air (corresponding to Fig. 3). Each alloy formed an adherent and continuous Al₂O₃-scale

layer of similar thickness

Fig. 5 Cross-sectional SEM images summarizing the oxidation behavior of Ni–Al and Ni–Al–Pt alloys exposed to air for 100 h at 1150 °C



alloys. The thickness of the Al_2O_3 scale that developed on Ni–12Al–18Pt was thinner than that on Ni–14Al–10Pt. The oxide scales that formed on the Ni–15Al–2Pt, Ni–12Al–10Pt and Ni–10Al–25Pt alloys consisted of a duplex structure comprised of an outer NiAl₂O₄ layer and an inner continuous layer of Al_2O_3 . The results in Fig. 5 suggest that the Al and Pt contents must be balanced in order to facilitate protective oxidation (i.e., more Pt is needed to compensate for a lower Al content).

Figure 6 shows the experimentally determined oxide map for Pt-modified γ -Ni–Al alloys exposed to air at 1150 °C. It is seen that Pt significantly decreases the



Fig. 6 Oxide map for the Ni–Al–Pt system exposed to air at 1150 $^{\circ}$ C for 100 h

critical Al content for exclusive Al_2O_3 formation. It is further seen that an increase in Pt content above ~10 at.% did not provide any further beneficial effect in promoting Al_2O_3 formation. The critical Al content for the formation of external Al_2O_3 was found to be about 10 at.% for alloys containing more than ~10 at.% Pt. Below this critical Al content, Al_2O_3 was present either as internal precipitates or as an inner layer of a duplex scale structure.

It can be inferred from Fig. 6 that Pt can promote Al₂O₃scale formation on γ , $\gamma + \gamma'$ and γ' alloys. Because the intermetallic γ' -Ni₃Al and solid solution γ -Ni have the same face center cubic (FCC) crystal structure, the mechanism by which Pt affects oxidation behavior should be similarly applicable to both phases; although, the ordered $L1_2$ arrangement of the γ' structure would bring differences. The 1150 °C Ni-Al-Pt phase diagram in Fig. 7 shows that both γ' and γ have large phase regions, extending from the Ni-rich side to the Pt-rich side. The nature of these phase regions implies that Pt can be added into each phase solely at the expense of Ni while keeping a fixed Al content. This is particularly important for the γ' -Ni₃Al phase, as it has a narrow Al composition range varying from 22 to 27 at.%. This phenomenological interpretation of Pt substituting almost solely for Ni in the γ' lattice was verified by a first-principles study by Chao et al. [58]. Their calculations showed that Pt has a predominant preference for the Ni sublattice (face centers) in the ordered L12 structure (Fig. 8) over a large temperature range and at compositions varying from Ni-rich, stoichiometric to Al-rich Ni₃Al. Consequently, Pt additions essentially enhance the effective Al content (relative to Ni) available for oxidation in a given crystallographic plane that contains



Fig. 7 Isothermal phase equilibria on Ni–Pt–Al alloys at 1150 °C [27]



Fig. 8 A schematic showing the L1₂ crystal structure of γ' -Ni₃Al

both Al and Pt. In other words, because of its virtually nonoxidizing nature, the presence of Pt in place of Ni would affect the early-stage competitive oxidation of Al and Ni to the extent that Al_2O_3 formation is kinetically favored.

Another important factor is that Pt has a negative chemical interaction with Al such that the Al activity (a_{Al}) decreases with increasing Pt content. Hayashi et al. [27, 59] reported this effect from a series of diffusion couples in which uphill diffusion of aluminum from the low-Al side to the high-Al side was measured. Copland [60] directly measured Al activity in a series of γ' -(Ni,Pt)₃Al alloys with varying Al (24 and 27 at.%) and Pt (2 to 25 at.%) contents, and his results validated Hayashi et al.'s conclusions. Therefore, any Pt surface enrichment owing to the selective oxidation of Ni and/or Al during the initial stages of oxidation would locally decrease a_{Al} at the oxide/alloy interface in comparison to a Pt-free alloy. This local decrease in a_{Al} would result in an increased a_{Al} gradient from the alloy to the scale/alloy interface, which, in turn, would lead to an increase in the outward diffusive flux of Al at the scale/alloy interface according to the relation [61]:

$$J_{\rm Al}^{\rm i} = -C_{\rm Al}^{\rm i} D_{\rm Al} \frac{\partial \ln a_{\rm Al}}{\partial x} \tag{1}$$

where C_{Al}^{i} is the interfacial Al content at the scale/alloy interface, and D_{Al} is the diffusion coefficient of Al. This increased Al flux would serve to assist in the fast and continuous development of an Al₂O₃-rich scale during the early stages of oxidation, as shown by Hayashi et al. [62].

It was also reported by Gleeson et al. [27] that Pt decreases the oxygen permeability in both γ -Ni and γ' -Ni₃Al alloys. This inference was arrived at by comparing the thickness of the internal oxidation zones formed in a Pt-free and Pt-modified γ -Ni alloys. Such a decrease in oxygen permeability would decrease the critical Al content within the alloy necessary for Al₂O₃ scale formation.

Thus, the following three effects of Pt in promoting Al_2O_3 -scale formation have been identified as: (1) Pt has a predominant site preference for the Ni sublattice in the ordered $L1_2$ structure so that the effective Al/Ni ratio is enhanced in certain crystallographic planes; (2) Pt has a negative chemical interaction with Al, which results in an increased Al diffusive flux at the scale/alloy interface when there is the subsurface enrichment of Pt; and (3) Pt decreases the oxygen permeability into the alloy which in turn, decreases the critical Al concentration for Al_2O_3 formation. Effect (1) is specific to the γ' phase, while the other two effects are relevant to both γ' and γ . All the three effects are believed to contrive to favor Al_2O_3 -scale formation on γ , $\gamma + \gamma'$, and γ' alloys.

Summary

The beneficial effects of Pt in promoting exclusive Al₂O₃ formation on Ni₃Al alloys have been more recently elucidated by Gleeson and colleagues [19, 62, 63]. According to these authors, the so-called Pt-effect can be ascribed to a number of contributing factors. First and foremost, Pt has a strong preference for occupying Ni sites in the ordered L1₂ crystal structure of γ' -Ni₃Al [58]. As a consequence, a given crystallographic plane of γ' containing both Al and Ni shows an increase in the Al: Ni atom fraction with increasing Pt addition. Such an effective Al enrichment at the γ' surface kinetically favors the formation of Al₂O₃ relative to NiO. An important aspect of this inference is the non-reacting nature of Pt to oxidation. Another contributing factor is that the Pt-containing γ' -based alloys show subsurface Pt enrichment during the very early stages of oxidation [62, 63]. This enrichment reduces Ni availability

for oxidation and can increase the Al supply to the evolving scale owing to the negative chemical interaction between Al and Pt. With regard to the latter, Pt decreases the chemical activity of Al [60], so that a subsurface Pt enrichment would confer an increased subsurface gradient in the Al activity and, hence, an increased Al flux from the alloy to the evolving scale. This effect would also contribute to kinetically enhancing Al₂O₃-scale formation. In a study of single-crystal γ' alloys it was found that the Pt effect is most pronounced when the Pt content is increased from 0 to 10 at.%, with only a minor benefit when increased from 10 to 20% Pt [64]. Based on this interpretation, it is clear that the Pt-effect is much different from the Cr-effect in promoting Al₂O₃-scale formation on γ , $\gamma+\gamma'$, and γ' alloys.

Acknowledgement The financial support for this research from the Office of Naval Research is gratefully acknowledged. The authors particularly thank Dr. David Shifler, Program Manager, for providing the guidance and commitment.

References

- 1. Smialek JL (2001) Surf Interface Anal 31:582
- 2. Reed RC (2006) The superalloys: fundamentals and applications. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge
- Pollock TM et al (2000) International Symposium on Superalloys 2000, TMS, Champion, Pennsylvania
- Evans AG, Mumm DR, Hutchinson JW, Meier GH, Pettit FS (2001) Prog Mater Sci 46:505
- 5. Levi CG (2004) Curr Opin Solid State and Mater Sci 8:77
- 6. Gleeson B (2006) J Prop and Power 22:375
- 7. Meier SM, Gupta DK (1994) Trans ASME 116:250
- 8. Shillington EAG, Clarke DR (1999) Acta Mater 47:1297
- 9. Barber B, Jordon E, Gell M, Geary A (1999) J Therm Spray Technol 8:79
- Karlsson AM, Hutchinson JW, Evans AG (2003) Mater Sci Eng A 351:244
- 11. Nicholls JR (2003) MRS Bulletin 28:659
- 12. Miracle DB (1993) Acta Metall Mater 41:649
- Doychak J (1984) In: Bailey GW (ed) Proceedings of the 42nd annual meeting of the electron microscopy society of America
- Grabke HJ, Brumm MW, Wagemann B (1996) Mater Corros 47:675
- 15. Lehnert G, Meinhardt H (1972) Electrodepos Surf Treat 1:71
- 16. Felten EJ (1976) Oxid Met 10:23
- 17. Chen JH, Little JA (1997) Surf Coat Technol 92:69
- Cadoret Y, Bacos MP, Josso P, Maurice V, Marcus P, Zanna S (2004) Mater Sci Forum 461–464:247
- 19. Hou PY, McCarty KF (2006) Scr Mater 54:937
- Zhang Y, Haynes JA, Lee WY, Wright IG, Pint BA, Cooley KM, Liaw PK (2001) Metall Mater Trans A 32A:1727
- 21. Grabke HJ, Wiemer D, Viefhaus H (1991) Appl Surf Sci 47:243
- 22. Pint BA (1997) Oxid Met 48:303
- Pint BA, Wright IG, Lee WY, Zhang Y, Prüßner K, Alexander KB (1998) Mater Sci Eng A 245:201

- 24. Clarke DR, Levi CG (2003) Annu Rev Mater Res 33:383
- Zhang Y, Haynes JA, Pint BA, Wright IG, Lee WY (2003) Surf Coat Technol 163–164:19
- Waltson WS, Schaeffer JC, Murphy WH (1996) In: Kissinger RD et al (eds) International Symposium on Superalloys 1996, TMS, Champion, Pennsylvania
- 27. Gleeson B, Wang W, Hayashi S, Sordelet D (2004) Mater Sci Forum 461–464:213
- 28. Gleeson B et al (2007) US Patent 7,273,662
- 29. Wood GC, Stott FH (1983) High Temp Corros NACE6 227
- 30. Stott FH (1997) Mater Sci Forum 251-254:19
- 31. Felten EJ, Pettit FS (1976) Oxid Met 10:189
- 32. Reddy KPR, Smialek JL, Cooper AR (1982) Oxid Met 17:429
- Doychak JK, Mitchell TE, Smialek JL (1985) Mater Res Soc Symp Proc 39:475
- 34. Prescott R, Graham MJ (1992) Oxid Met 38:233
- Lipkin DM, Clarke DR, Hollatz M, Bobeth M, Pompe W (1997) Corros Sci 39:231
- Hou PY, Paulikas AP, Veal BW (2004) Mater Sci Forum 461– 464:671
- Doychak J (1994) In: Westbrook JH, Fleischer RL (eds) Intermetallic compounds, Chapter 43, vol 1. Wiley, New York
- 38. Pettit FS (1967) Trans Metall Soc AIME 239:1296
- 39. Brady MP, Gleeson B, Wright IG (2000) JOM 52:16
- 40. Gesmundo F, Niu Y (1998) Oxid Met 50:1
- 41. Whittle DP, Wood GC, Evans DJ, Scully DB (1967) Acta Metall 15:1747
- 42. Clemens D, Quadakkers WJ, Singheiser L (1998) In: Hou PY, McNallan MJ, Oltra R, Opila EJ, Shores D (eds) High temperature corrosion and materials chemistry, vol 98–9. The Electrochemical Society, Pennington, NJ, p 134
- Wright IG (1972) Metals and Ceramics Information Center Report MCIC–72-07
- 44. Wallwork GR, Hed AZ (1971) Oxid Met 3:171
- 45. Wagner C (1965) Corros Sci 5:751
- 46. Stott FH, Wood GC, Stringer J (1995) Oxid Met 44:113
- 47. Sauer JP, Rapp RA, Hirth JP (1982) Oxid Met 18:285
- 48. Jackson PRS, Wallwork GR (1984) Oxid Met 21:135
- 49. Guan SW, Smeltzer WW (1994) Oxid Met 42:375
- 50. Hagel WC (1965) Corros 21:316
- 51. Coupland DR, Hall CW, McGill IR (1982) Platin Met Rev 26:186
- 52. Coupland DR, McGill IR, Corti CW, Selman GL (1980) Proc Environ Degrad High Temp Mater 2:26
- 53. Tatlock GJ, Hurd TJ (1984) Oxid Met 22:201
- 54. Tatlock GJ, Hurd TJ (1990) Werkst Korros 41:710
- 55. Tatlock GJ, Hurd TJ (1987) Platin Met Rev 31:26
- 56. Felten EJ (1976) Oxid Met 10:23
- 57. Tatlock GJ, Hurd TJ, Punni JS (1987) Platin Met Rev 31:26
- 58. Jiang C, Sordelet DJ, Gleeson B (2006) Acta Mater 54:1147
- Hayashi S, Wang W, Sordelet DJ, Gleeson B (2005) Metall Mater Trans A 36A:1769
- 60. Copland E (2007) J Phase Equilib Diffus 28:38
- 61. Wilkinson D (2000) Mass transport in solids and fluids. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge
- Hayashi S, Narita T, Gleeson B (2006) Mater Sci Forum 522– 523:229
- Hayashi S, Ford SI, Young DJ, Sordelet DJ, Besser MF, Gleeson B (2005) Acta Mater 53:3319
- Qin F, Jiang C, Anderegg JW, Jenks CJ, Gleeson B, Sordelet DJ, Thiel PA (2007) Surf Sci 601:376